Use of a Disclosed Plaque Visualization Technique Improved the Self-Performed, Tooth Brushing Ability of Primary Schoolchildren

Napa Chounchaisithi DDS*, Busayarat Santiwong DDS, PhD*, Sirikarn Sutthavong DDS, MPH**, Pornpun Asvanit DDS, MS, MEd*

* Department of Pediatric Dentistry, Faculty of Dentistry, Chulalongkorn University, Bangkok, Thailand
** Dental department, Phramongkutklao Hospital, The Royal Thai Army, Bangkok, Thailand

Background: Disclosing agents have a long history of use as an aid in children’s tooth brushing instruction. However, their benefit when used to improve self-performed tooth brushing ability without any tooth brushing instruction has not been investigated.

Objective: To evaluate the effect of disclosed plaque visualization on improving the self-performed, tooth brushing ability of primary schoolchildren.

Material and Method: A cluster-randomized, crossover study was conducted in Nakhon Nayok province, Thailand. A total of 122 second-grade schoolchildren, aged 8-10 years old, from 12 schools were randomly divided into 2 groups. The first group was assigned to brush with disclosed plaque visualization, while the other group brushed without disclosed plaque visualization. One month later, the groups switched procedures. Tooth brushing ability was evaluated by the subjects’ reduction in patient hygiene performance (PHP) scores. The data were analyzed using repeated-measures analysis of variance, with significance set at p<0.05.

Results: Disclosed plaque visualization had a significant effect on improving the children’s self-performed, tooth brushing ability in all areas of the mouth (p<0.001), particularly for anterior teeth, mandibular teeth, buccal surfaces, and areas adjacent to the gingival margin (p<0.001).

Conclusion: Disclosed plaque visualization is a viable technique to improve children’s self-performed tooth brushing ability, and could be used in school-based oral health promotion programs.

Keywords: Disclosing agent, Plaque visualization, School-based tooth-brushing, Self-performed tooth brushing

J Med Assoc Thai 2014; 97 (Suppl. 2): S88-S95
Full text. e-Journal: http://www.jmatonline.com

Dental caries and gingivitis are plaque-mediated diseases. Poor oral hygiene and inappropriate dietary behavior can lead to increased plaque accumulation, which increases the risk of the initiation of dental caries and gingivitis(3). Based on the results of the sixth Thailand National Oral Health Survey, dental caries and gingivitis remain public health problems among Thai primary schoolchildren, particularly in rural areas. Primary schoolchildren living in rural areas had a higher prevalence of dental caries and gingivitis, but received less dental services than those living in urban areas(3). The survey also demonstrated that there is still disparity in dental treatment delivery across the socioeconomic classes. Despite universal health care coverage, socioeconomic inequality in dental care still exists among Thai primary schoolchildren(3). This is, in part, due to the shortage and unequal distribution of dentists in rural areas(4). Because of this, strategies to provide oral health education using dental auxiliary personnel should be adopted to reduce oral health inequalities(3,5).

In Thailand, primary schoolchildren are the main target group of oral health improvement programs, such as the universal sealant for permanent molars program, and health care education in schools. School-based oral health education programs have incorporated sessions designed to enhance the tooth-brushing skills of primary schoolchildren(6,7). When developed during childhood, tooth-brushing skills are more likely to continue into adulthood and become life-long habits(6). Indeed, good oral health behaviors during childhood were significant predictors of...
periodontal disease in adults based on a ten year follow-up in a study in Denmark(9). Therefore, it is important to promote tooth-brushing skills at a young age to empower children to have control over their own oral health.

Disclosing agents have long been used as an integral part of children’s tooth-brushing instruction. The contrasting color of a disclosing agent provides a helpful means to differentiate plaque, which is white or yellow in color, from similarly colored tooth surfaces, and helps the child see where to brush. Previous studies have revealed that tooth brushing instruction together with plaque self-visualization using disclosing agents and a mirror resulted in a marked improvement in oral hygiene and in gingivitis in children(10,11). However, currently there are no studies showing the benefits of the use of disclosing agents without tooth brushing instruction.

Therefore, the purpose of the present study was to evaluate the effect of disclosed plaque visualization on improving the self-performed, tooth brushing ability of primary schoolchildren. This is the first study to demonstrate that disclosed plaque visualization could help improve the self-performed, tooth brushing ability of schoolchildren. The results of the present study would be of interest for inclusion in school-based oral health education programs.

**Material and Method**

This cluster-randomized, crossover study was carried out between December 2011 and February 2012. The Chulalongkorn University Institutional Ethics Committee approved the protocol for this study.

**Participants**

The present study sample comprised second-grade schoolchildren, from a total of 12 public schools in Nakhon Nayok province, Thailand. All schools agreed to participate in the study. One hundred and eighty-eight children, aged 8-10 years old, with normal physical and mental development, were invited to participate in the present study. None of the children had ever used disclosing agents or received oral hygiene instruction during the 3 months prior to the study. One hundred and thirty-five children (72%) with erupted permanent first molars, maxillary right central incisors and left central mandibular incisors were recruited into our study after signed consent forms were returned by their parents.

The 12 participating schools were assigned as clusters. Each school was randomly allocated to be in either group A or B, by simple random sampling. There were 69 children (5 schools) and 66 children (7 schools) in groups A and B, respectively. The children in group A were assigned to brush with disclosed plaque visualization, and at a later month brush without disclosed plaque visualization, while the children in group B were assigned the opposite sequence.

A dentist from the HRH Maha Chakri Sirindhorn Medical Center, who did not participate further in the present study, carried out participant enrollment and random group allocation.

**Plaque assessment**

Plaque assessment was conducted after cotton buds soaked with a disclosing agent (6% erythrosine solution, Department of Pharmacology, Faculty of Dentistry, Chulalongkorn University, Bangkok, Thailand) were applied to all the subject’s tooth surfaces, and they had rinsed out any excess solution. The patient hygiene performance (PHP)(12) was modified by assessing plaque on both the buccal and lingual surfaces of the following six permanent teeth: all 4 first molars and the maxillary right and mandibular left central incisors. If the designated central incisor was missing, the adjacent central incisor was used. Each tooth surface was divided vertically into a mesial third (M), middle third and distal third (D). The middle third was further divided horizontally into a gingival third (A), middle third (B), and occlusal third (C), as shown in Fig. 1. Each of the subdivisions was examined for the presence of pink stain, with a score of 0 for no stain, and 1 for stain present. The PHP score for each surface, which ranged from 0-5, was obtained by adding the five subdivisions’ scores. The PHP score of each area was calculated as the total PHP score of all surfaces in the area divided by the number of surfaces examined. The total PHP score of the M, D, and A subdivisions of all surfaces was divided by 12 surfaces to determine the PHP score of the area adjacent to the gingival margin, and the total PHP score of the remaining subdivisions was divided by 12 surfaces to determine the PHP score of the area distant to the gingival margin. The intra-examiner reliability of the PHP scores, by Cohen’s kappa test, was 0.96.

**Experimental protocol**

In the present study, we used a crossover design to eliminate within-subject variation because individual tooth brushing ability varies according to age and personal skills(13-17). Each child used both techniques and thus acted as their own control.
At the beginning of the study, the participants were assessed to establish a baseline PHP score and received scaling and rubber cup prophylaxis to reduce their PHP score to zero. Each child was interviewed about their tooth brushing habits, i.e. regular brushing and parental supervision with brushing.

The first session was performed one month after the baseline examination. Children had their plaque disclosed, and their pre-brushing PHP score was assessed. Each child was individually seated at a table and given a new child-size, soft bristle, flat-trim toothbrush (Berman® Standard, Rinchokechai Company Limited, Samutprakarn, Thailand). Group A was assigned to brush with disclosed plaque visualization, and group B was assigned to brush without using this technique. In group A, the child was given a 14x14 cm adjustable table-standing mirror, and a 5x7 cm handheld mirror. A dentist instructed the child to use the two mirrors to see the stained plaque on their teeth and then told the child to “thoroughly brush the stain off”. No specific technique or order was suggested, so that each child could brush in his/her own manner. For brushing without disclosed plaque visualization, the child did not receive mirrors. The dentist only directed the child to brush as they did at home. After two minutes of brushing, each child had his/her plaque disclosed again and his/her post-brushing PHP score was assessed. Rubber cup prophylaxis was then performed to reduce the child’s PHP score to zero. One month later, the second session was performed the same as the first session but the techniques used by each group were reversed.

The procedures in the present study were carried out at the schools by two trained dentists. The first dentist performed the plaque assessment; he was blinded to the technique assigned to each child, and the second dentist performed the disclosed plaque visualization technique. To maintain blinding, plaque assessment and tooth brushing took place in different rooms.

Statistical analysis

The reduction in PHP score was calculated for each individual as the difference between their pre-brushing PHP score and their post-brushing PHP score. The percentage of PHP score reduction was calculated as the PHP score reduction x100 divided by the pre-brushing PHP score. The independent t-test and Chi-squared test were used to compare the characteristics of each group. The repeated-measures analysis of variance (ANOVA), followed by the Bonferroni post hoc test, were used in data analysis. Techniques and tooth areas were analyzed as within-subject variables. Group, sex, parental supervision while brushing, and a minimum of twice-a-day tooth brushing were analyzed between-subject variables. All calculations were performed using SPSS software version 17.0 (SPSS, Inc., Chicago, IL, USA), with significance set at $p<0.05$.

Results

Of the 135 participants, 122 (90%) children (65 males and 57 females) completely participated in the study and were included in the data analysis. The study flow diagram is presented in Fig. 2. As shown in Table 1, there were no significant differences between the groups with respect to age, sex, baseline PHP score, and tooth brushing habits.

PHP score reduction according to tooth areas/surfaces

Table 2 shows the reduction in PHP scores based on tooth areas or surfaces. The authors combined the data from both experimental sessions, which was then analyzed using repeated-measures ANOVA. The authors found that brushing with disclosed plaque visualization resulted in a significantly greater reduction.
in PHP scores in all areas evaluated (1.24±0.42) than did with brushing without disclosed plaque visualization (0.92±0.35) (p<0.001). The percentage in reduction was 8.22% greater in the disclosed plaque visualization brushing session.

Children using disclosed plaque visualization during brushing demonstrated a significantly greater reduction in the PHP score of their anterior teeth than that of children not using disclosed plaque visualization (p<0.001). In contrast, there was no effect of disclosed plaque visualization on the PHP score reduction of posterior teeth (p = 0.407). The effect of disclosed plaque visualization on PHP score reduction was significant for buccal (p<0.001) and lingual surfaces (p = 0.001), as well as for maxillary and mandibular teeth (p<0.001). However, the data revealed a greater reduction in the PHP scores for buccal surfaces and mandibular teeth (1.78±0.56 and 1.53±0.63) than for lingual surfaces and maxillary teeth (0.70±0.44 and 0.94±0.38) (p<0.001), respectively. The differences in the percentage of PHP score reduction for anterior teeth, buccal surfaces, and mandibular teeth between brushing with and without disclosed plaque visualization were 23.20%, 12.22%, and 12.26%, respectively.

Analyzing the data based on tooth surface subdivision indicated that significantly greater plaque reduction was observed in areas adjacent to the gingival margin when brushing with disclosed plaque visualization (0.72±0.31) than without (0.43±0.27) (p<0.001). However, no significant difference was found between techniques in areas distant to the gingival margin (p = 0.281).

**Effect of sex, regular brushing, and parental supervision while brushing on PHP score reduction**

The authors observed no significant effect of sex, parental supervision during brushing, or a minimum of twice-a-day tooth brushing on PHP score reduction during brushing with and without disclosed plaque visualization (Table 3).

**Discussion**

Previous studies have demonstrated that disclosing agents can be successfully used as a tool for oral health education and tooth brushing technique instruction\(^{(1,11)}\). However, there are no studies on improving the self-performed, tooth brushing ability in schoolchildren where only the application of a disclosing agent was used without any tooth brushing instruction. Our results indicate that, even when tooth brushing instruction was not provided, this technique was effective in improving the self-performed, tooth brushing ability of 8-10 year old schoolchildren.

With regard to specific areas of the mouth, the results of the present study demonstrated marked improvement in the subjects’ self-performed tooth brushing ability on anterior teeth, buccal surfaces, and mandibular teeth, all of which are clearly visible to the

**Table 1. Characteristics of the study population**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Group A</th>
<th>Group B</th>
<th>p-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Age (Mean ± SD)(^a)</td>
<td>8.3±0.4</td>
<td>8.2±0.3</td>
<td>0.447</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Males, n (%)(^b)</td>
<td>33 (53)</td>
<td>32 (53)</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baseline PHP score(^c)</td>
<td>3.96±0.21</td>
<td>3.97±0.32</td>
<td>0.808</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum of twice-a-day toothbrushing, n (%)(^d)</td>
<td>40 (65)</td>
<td>37 (62)</td>
<td>0.890</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parental supervision with brushing, n (%)(^e)</td>
<td>16 (26)</td>
<td>16 (27)</td>
<td>1.000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\(^a\) Statistical evaluation by independent t-test, \(^b\) Statistical evaluation by Chi-squared test
Table 2. The effect of disclosed plaque visualization on PHP score reduction based on tooth areas/surfaces (n = 122)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Area</th>
<th>PHP score reduction Mean ± SD (%)</th>
<th>p-value</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No disclosed plaque visualization</td>
<td>Disclosed plaque visualization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All</td>
<td>0.92±0.35 (22.89)</td>
<td>1.24±0.42 (31.11)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Anterior vs. posterior teeth</td>
<td>1.29±0.70 (32.83)</td>
<td>2.18±0.69 (56.03)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buccal vs. lingual surface</td>
<td>1.29±0.57 (31.52)</td>
<td>1.78±0.56 (43.75)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maxillary vs. mandibular teeth</td>
<td>0.78±0.45 (19.20)</td>
<td>0.94±0.38 (23.40)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adjacent to vs. distant to the gingival margin</td>
<td>0.43±0.27 (14.19)</td>
<td>0.72±0.31 (24.16)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Statistical evaluation by repeated-measures ANOVA, Bonferroni post hoc test

Table 3. The effect of sex, minimum twice-a-day toothbrushing and parental supervision while brushing on PHP score reduction (n = 122)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Variable</th>
<th>PHP score reduction Mean ± SD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No disclosed plaque visualization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex</td>
<td>0.91±0.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>0.93±0.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>0.88±0.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minimum twice-a-day toothbrushing</td>
<td>0.94±0.31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>0.340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>0.91±0.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Parental supervision while brushing</td>
<td>0.92±0.36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>0.936</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>0.88±0.41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>p-value</td>
<td>0.722</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Statistical evaluation by repeated-measures ANOVA, Bonferroni post hoc test
tooth and at the area adjacent to the gingival margin\textsuperscript{19,20} because these areas are related to initial smooth surface caries lesions and gingivitis. In the present study, the authors found that plaque reduction in the areas adjacent to the gingival margin was significantly greater after tooth brushing with disclosed plaque visualization. Thus, the authors conclude that disclosed plaque visualization can enhance self-performed, tooth brushing in the areas adjacent to the gingival margin, even if no specific tooth brushing technique is presented to the children.

In lower socioeconomic regions that suffer from a shortage of dentists and poor access to dental services, the implementation of oral health education programs in schools has the potential to reach efficiently a large group of children. According to the World Health Organization, schools are a suitable community-based setting for promoting good oral health at a young age\textsuperscript{21}. The present study suggests that disclosed plaque visualization techniques could enhance the self-performed, tooth brushing ability of primary schoolchildren. Plaque visualization techniques could be presented in school-based programs to improve children’s tooth brushing practices. These techniques are simple and low-cost, requiring no complicated materials or specially trained personnel for tooth brushing instruction. Dental auxiliary personnel and schoolteachers can work together to promote tooth brushing in the school setting, particularly in rural areas. Schoolteachers are responsible for supervising tooth brushing after lunch\textsuperscript{21}, and dental auxiliary personnel, e.g. dental nurses, can play a role in giving, and the periodic reinforcement of, tooth brushing instructions for difficult to reach and problem areas of the mouth. However, further long-term study on the effect of the use of disclosing agents when presented in school-based programs to maintain good oral hygiene in children is recommended.

**Conclusion**

Disclosing agent use significantly improved self-performed, tooth-brushing ability of primary schoolchildren. Disclosed plaque visualization is a viable technique to improve children’s self-performed, tooth-brushing ability and could be used in school-based, oral health promotion programs.

**Acknowledgement**

The graduate school, Chulalongkorn University, supported the present study. The authors thank Dr. Tida Tangtragoonpaisarn for her assistance in plaque assessment, Dr. Kittirungruang for statistical analysis advice, and Dr. Kevin Tompkins for his assistance in editing this manuscript.

**Potential conflicts of interest**

None.

**References**


การใช้เทคนิคการองค์รวมการติดสิ่งของรายจุดหรือเพื่อเพิ่มความสามารถในการแพร่พันคุณลักษณะของเด็กขั้นประถมศึกษา

นก ชวนชัยธิราช, อุบลรัตน์ ดันพี, ศิลปะณัฐ สุทัศนทิพย์, พรพรรณ อัศวณิชย์

อุปมีลักษณะ: สารองรายจุดหรืออายุเกินกว่าเกณฑ์การสอนแพร่พันในเด็กมากเป็นสาตาม อย่างไรก็ตามไม่มีการศึกษาถึงประโยชน์ของการใช้สารองรายจุดหรือเพื่อเพิ่มความสามารถในการแพร่พันคุณลักษณะของเด็กขั้นประถมศึกษา โดยไม่มีการสอนแพร่พัน

วัตถุประสงค์: เพื่อศึกษาผลของการองค์รวมการติดสิ่งของรายจุดหรือเพื่อเพิ่มความสามารถในการแพร่พันคุณลักษณะของเด็กขั้นประถมศึกษา

วิสัยและวิธีการ: การศึกษานี้เป็นการศึกษาแบบใช้แก่กลุ่มและกลุ่มเป็นกลุ่มที่จัดทำเป็นกลุ่ม 2 กลุ่ม แบบทดลองการสอนแพร่พัน โดยองค์รวมการติดสิ่งของรายจุดหรือ ในขณะที่กลุ่มที่สอนทดลองการสอนแพร่พันโดยไม่ใช้การติดสิ่งของรายจุดหรือ หลังจากนั้น 1 เดือน ทดลองการสอนแพร่พันโดยใช้การติดสิ่งของรายจุดหรือ ใช้มาตรฐานการวัดผล PHP(พันธุ์ลักษณะแพร่พัน) ที่สอดคล้องกับการศึกษาความแพร่พัน 根据วิธีการในการวิเคราะห์ผลร้อยละระดับน้อยสี่สิบ

ผลการศึกษา: การองค์รวมการติดสิ่งของรายจุดหรือเพื่อเพิ่มความสามารถในการแพร่พันคุณลักษณะของเด็กขั้นประถมศึกษา โดยรวมทั้งปี (p<0.001) โดยเฉพาะในเด็กที่สอนแพร่พัน ท่อน้ำ ด้านแก๊ด และเสื้อของหลัก (p<0.001)

สรุป: การองค์รวมการติดสิ่งของรายจุดหรือเพื่อเพิ่มความสามารถในการแพร่พันคุณลักษณะของเด็ก โดยสามารถน่าเป็นไป ในกรณีเด็กที่สุดลงที่โรงเรียนได้